

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

Date of Hub Review:

November 3, 2006

Participants:

Laura Timothy; BART, Carolyn Clevenger; Metropolitan Transportation Commission, Ted Yurek; SamTrans, Ron Niewiarowski; San Francisco Metropolitan Transportation Agency (SFMTA), Lisa Young; San Francisco County Transportation Authority, Carol Levine, Wilbur Smith Associates; Harley Goldstrom, Harley & Associates.

Existing Hub Conditions:

The Caltrain Station, located in the South of Market area of Downtown San Francisco, is the northern terminus for train service between San Francisco and Gilroy; Caltrain operates approximately 96 trains each weekday including local trains, a limited stop train each hour, and "Baby Bullet" express trains during peak periods. On average, Caltrain transports approximately 32,000 daily riders each weekday.

The station is also served by connecting transit on adjacent streets via the San Francisco Municipal Railway (Muni) and Amtrak (bus). Muni provides connecting accessible bus service on lines 10-Townsend, 15 Third, 30-Stockton, 45-Union/Stockton, 47 Van Ness, and 76 Marin Headlands. Weekday peak hour service is also provided on the 16AX/BX Noriega Express, 80X Gateway Express, 81X Caltrain Express, and 82X Levi Plaza Express. Additionally, Muni Metro (light rail) service is also provided on the system's N-Judah line. Amtrak Thruway Bus picks up passengers in front of the station on Townsend Street with service to Emeryville Amtrak Station for connections to the Capitol Corridor and Amtrak's San Joaquin and Coast Starlight trains.

It should also be noted that Muni is expected to inaugurate service on its new Third Street Light Rail, T-Line, in January 2007. The T-Line will operate along Bayshore Boulevard and Third Street, between the Caltrain Bayshore Station, downtown San Francisco and will replace the existing Muni 15-Third Street bus line. As such, the new T-Third Metro line will effectively connect all of the Third Street neighborhoods to the full Muni Metro system at 4th and King, providing a vital link between Caltrain, the southeast sector of San Francisco, and the rest of the City.

CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

WAYFINDING:

The hub's existing signage offers perhaps the greatest opportunity for improvement. Reviewer comments focused on the lack of comprehensive directional signs guiding customers between Caltrain, the Muni Metro boarding platform, and Muni and Amtrak bus stops. In general, signs were noted to be missing at key decision points to make these connections.

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

All of the transit operators and the customers served by the station would greatly benefit from a new, up-to date, and consistent new wayfinding sign program. The program would provide consistent, easy to read, easy to find hierarchical information allowing customers to flow between Caltrain, Muni Metro and Muni/Amtrak bus stops.

Wayfinding program corrective actions should include but not be limited to:

Identification of station or transit operator

- Add station name and operator identification prominently to the Muni Metro platform (see checklist questions #1, 2; photos #14-15);
- While respecting architectural integrity, enhance the station name on the front of Caltrain station (see checklist question # 1, photo #1);
- Identify all entrances to the Caltrain station (see checklist question #2, photos #2-5);
- Add operator logos, where appropriate, to Caltrain station and Muni Metro platform entrances (see checklist questions #3, 5; photos: #2-5, #14-15).

Moving around or entering or exiting the station

- Install signs at decision points to direct passengers between the Caltrain station, Muni Metro platform, and Muni and Amtrak bus stops. Directions should also be provided to future RTIC, bicycle facilities, and to delineate the accessible pathway through the hub facility including:
 - Caltrain Station (photos #2, 4);
 - Future RTIC's;
 - Muni Metro platform (photos #7, 8, 13)
 - Amtrak Thruway bus stop (photo #2);
 - Muni bus stops (photos #7, 8);
 - Taxi stand (photo #8).
- Use a consistent set of graphics, fonts, and colors for directional signs (see checklist question #12);
- Include operator logos on all directional signs (see checklist questions #6, 11-12, photos #7, 8);

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

Identification of where to board or wait for transit

- Add better identifying signage for Muni Metro boarding platform (see checklist question #17; photos #14-15)
- Better identify Muni bus stops especially from a distance. Currently, Muni logos and route numbers are small and hard to find. Some stops do not have bus route flags; routes are identified on bus shelters but are not always visible from both sides (see checklist questions #17, 19, 21, 24; photos #9-11)
- Install more prominent signage for Amtrak Thruway bus stop. This stop should also be included on the local vicinity map (see checklist questions #17, 19, 21; photos #2, 12);
- Include large and bold operator logos on all bus stop signs (see checklist question #19, 21; photos #2, 9-11);

CUSTOMER INFORMATION:

Customer information is provided by the individual operators for their service only. Minimal hub or vicinity information is provided. Customer information displays should be coordinated with wayfinding signage at key locations within the facility including these corrective actions.

Regional Transit Information Center (RTIC)

Currently, the Caltrain Station does not have an RTIC although there is a very visible information kiosk located in the lobby (photo #6). This kiosk includes Caltrain and Muni schedules and maps. Checklist comments suggest the following improvements for regional transit information:

- An RTIC should be located in the lobby of the Caltrain Station and include:
 1. The regional 511.org transit map; and
 2. Subregional or system map for local operators (see checklist question #28).
- Combine RTIC installation with local transit information wherever possible (see checklist questions #28-31; photo #6).
- Add directional signage to the RTIC from locations throughout the hub particularly from the Muni Metro platform.

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

Local Transit Information

- Establish locations in the hub where local transit information is provided (see checklist questions #28-32) including:
 1. Subregional or system map for local operators;
 2. Schedules and service hours (photo #16);
 3. Fares and specific system information;
 4. Hub layout map (photo #17); and
 5. Local vicinity map (photo #18).
- These displays should be combined with the RTIC where possible. The following locations are suggested:
 - Inside the Caltrain Lobby (see checklist question #28; photo #6);
 - Muni Metro boarding platform (photo #14);

REAL-TIME SIGNAGE:

Existing Real-Time Signage

Muni Metro has real-time signage at the boarding platform but it is not always working properly. Each Caltrain boarding platform has variable message signs which are somewhat difficult to read (photo #19). These can be used for real-time information in the event of service delays. There is a real-time display in the lobby of the Caltrain Station but this is not yet operational (photo #20).

Future Real-Time Signage Installation

Based on the observed existing conditions, it is recommended that future real-time signage actions include, but not be limited to the following:

- Implement a real-time signage program which includes all transit (Caltrain, Muni, and Amtrak) routes at this hub; signs should be large and easy to read. (see checklist question #34)
- A central real-time display including next train/ bus information and departure times for all services at the hub should be provided at the Caltrain Station lobby (see checklist question #38)

MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

STATION PHOTOGRAPHS



1. Main station entrance. Note lack of operator logo.



2. West Station Entrance/Exit. Note Amtrak Thruway bus stop flag (circled).



3. West Station Entrance. Small, difficult to see logo.



4. North Station Entrance. No identifying logo.

MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING



5. East Station Entrance/Exit.
Small, difficult to see logos.



6. Caltrain Lobby. Information Kiosk.
Potential RTIC location.



7. Caltrain Boarding platforms. Note small directional signage to Muni Metro and Bus lines.



8. Caltrain Station Lobby. Small directional signage to Muni and Taxis.

MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING



9. Muni bus stop and shelter. Note small logo and lack of bus stop flag.



10. Muni bus stop and shelter with small logo. Note lack of bus stop flag.



11. Muni Bus stop sign. Does not include schedule information.



12. Amtrak Thruway bus stop. Includes schedules but bus stop flag is not prominent.

MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING



13. Pathway leading from Caltrain to Muni Metro Station. Lacks prominent directional signage.



14. Muni Metro Boarding Platforms. No clear directional signage for opposite direction platforms.



15. Muni Metro Boarding Platforms. No large and bold identifying logo.



16. Information kiosk in Caltrain Station lobby with Caltrain Schedules.

MTC Regional Transit Hub Performance Review Project

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING



17. Caltrain Station Vicinity Map.
Lacks nearby points of interest and Amtrak stop.



18. San Francisco transit and local points of interest map.



19. Variable message signs on Caltrain boarding platforms.



20. Caltrain Lobby. Note location of future real-time signage.

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

Hub Review Checklist Summary			
			WAYFINDING
			Identification of station or transit operator
Yes	No	N/A	
3	3		1. The hub is clearly identified, visible from surrounding roadways by vehicular and pedestrian traffic. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Signage on the West side of the station could be larger • Signage at the 4th Street entry is good. North side entrance sign is too small. • Signs are at different scales. Caltrain sign is at vehicular scale. Muni Metro signage is of a pedestrian scale.
3	3		2. Entrances into the hub are clearly identified, visible from approaches by vehicular and pedestrian traffic. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No signage on street • Few signs on the south side of the station • Signs are missing (or small) above entrances • Caltrain logo signs located at entrances could be larger
3	4		3. Transit operators serving the hub are clearly identified at the entrances with their logo and name. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimal signage for Muni and Amtrak bus • Muni signage is only on bus stops • Hub is separated with different operators loading from different areas • Muni bus shelters need station hub name
2	1		4. Station identification reinforces information on printed maps and schedules.
2	4		5. Station name is identified on the entrance sign along with agency logo. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Muni entrance sign • Caltrain Station needs the Caltrain logo and station name
			Moving around or entering or exiting the station
Yes	No	N/A	
3	2		6. Agency logos are included with names on directional signs within the facility. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Muni signage for Metro or Bus • Some Caltrain logos present • Directional signs for Caltrain ticket machines and boarding platforms
2	4		7. Turnstile level street exit directional signs also include connection agency names and logs.
2	2		8. Vital connections information is grouped together on signs.

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

1	4		9. Connection directions are provided at each decision point and there are no gaps in the connection directional information flow.
1	5		10. Exiting directional signs list a hierarchy of the popular destinations and connecting services to reach these destinations.
	6		11. Where connecting transit service is not within the station, clear directional signage (including walking distance) is provided to these services. All sign placement complies with 2004 ADAAG guidelines. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No walking distances available • Minimal signage • Limited signs on Caltrain platform and none to N-Judah • No directional signs between Caltrain and Muni Metro • Difficult to tell where to get Muni connections
3	3	1	12. In stations with multiple track/gate or train/ferry service, confirmation of agency, destination, and real-time departure is associated with those services. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need Real-Time departure information for Muni • Existing signage is not consistent • Caltrain departure track is clearly marked
3		1	13. Clear sightlines are maintained to signs and all sign placement complies with 2004 ADAAG guidelines.
2	5		14. Exiting connection information is color-coded to emphasize and make it easier to find directions and connections.
3	3		15. Signs are legible with adequate message size appropriate for viewing distance, proper contrast ratios, and illumination levels.
2	3	1	16. Arrows are of consistent design and are bold in visual balance with text and are closely associated with their messages.
			Identification of where to board or wait for transit
Yes	No	N/A	
5	3		17. Transit boarding platforms are clearly and boldly identified. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Muni Metro signage at platforms or directing you to the platform • No directional signage from Caltrain to Muni • Caltrain signs are clearly identified
1	2	2	18. Where a particular transit route utilizes different boarding points for opposite directions of travel, directional signage is provided to the different boarding point including platform route number, name, and route terminus (a place name).

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

2	3		<p>19. At commuter rail, ferry terminals or bus stations, the boarding area identification number is large and bold with service agency, destination, number, and “real-time” departure is provided.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No large and bold identification • No Real-Time information • Track numbers are bold for Caltrain • Muni LRT is not clearly defined as Muni
3	2		<p>20. Schedule frequency and last departure information are provided at transit boarding platforms and are consistent with 2004 ADAAG guidelines.</p>
3	3		<p>21. Bus stop signs have agency logos large and bold.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Muni bus stops are not clearly defined from a distance. Logos and route numbers are small and hard to find • No signs except what is printed on shelters • Muni logo is visible but route information is not • Logos are present on shelter but are not very visible • No Muni signs at the Route 10, 30, and 45 stops
2	1	1	<p>22. Bus stop signs have accessibility and parking restrictions as auxiliary signs below the basic bus stop signs.</p>
4		1	<p>23. Bus route identification on bus stop signs comply with 2004 ADAAG Guidelines - minimum 2” route number character height.</p>
3	1	1	<p>24. Bus stop sign faces are visible from each approach direction.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Signs for routes 30 and 45 are only visible from one approach
2	3		<p>25. Bus shelters have associated bus stop signs which are consistent with the design guidelines described in this checklist.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No flag at bus stop signs • Muni stops don’t have poll signs. Information is only located on the bus shelter

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

			CUSTOMER INFORMATION
			Regional Transit Information (RTIC)
Yes	No	N/A	
2	4		<p>26. Transit information in Regional Transit Information Display Cases is accurate and easy to read.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Informational kiosk contains mostly Caltrain information • No RTIC exists • Schedule information is in small print
	6		<p>27. Transit operator and route maps for the nine-county San Francisco Bay Area are posted in the Regional Transit Information Display Cases.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One good San Francisco Map but no other regional information • Map only contains Muni and Caltrain information
			Local Transit Information
2	4		<p>28. Hub specific information is provided in a case adjacent to the Regional Transit Information Display Case and at other critical locations at the hub.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need to include Caltrain, BART, and MUNI system maps
4	2		<p>29. Hub layout maps are provided in the hub information display case.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Map is small and has limited land uses • Need to include Muni stops and larger local area
5	1		<p>30. Map of hub vicinity with landmarks and attractions is posted in the hub information case.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No maps with major destinations provided • Only one map provided
5	1		<p>31. Posted transit information (i.e. maps, schedules) is well maintained, accurate and easy to find.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Muni schedule information or directions • No Muni information, only Caltrain schedule • Muni schedule information is only posted at bus stops
6			<p>32. Schedules, fare, transfer information and hub layout maps are located near bus stops and loading platforms.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes, Muni schedules are located at bus stops • No Hub Map
4	2		<p>33. Printed schedules and maps distributed at the hub contain accurate information and are consistent with the information provided in the Regional Transit Information Display Cases.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Only Caltrain map/schedule are distributed at the hub • No other regional information • No Muni brochures

HUB REVIEW FINDINGS

SAN FRANCISCO CALTRAIN STATION 4TH & KING

			REAL-TIME SIGNAGE
			Existing Real-Time Signage
Yes	No	N/A	
4	3		34. Real-time signage is provided at the hub. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No real-time signage for Muni • Variable message signs on Caltrain platforms • Future real-time signage in lobby
			35. Location of signs (indicate on station diagram). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Caltrain Platforms and lobby.
			36. Description and photo of signage types.
			37. Identification of transit services included on real-time signage (Include operator and mode). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Train and route numbers as well as next train information
			Future Real-Time Signage Installations
			38. Describe location(s) for future real-time signage locations (indicate on station diagram). Refer to Appendix A Real-Time Technology Guidelines page A-24 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In lobby of Caltrain Station that list departure times of all services • Real-Time signage that includes Muni information
			39. Describe transit services that would be included in real-time signage displays. Refer to Appendix A pages A-24-26.